

## BEME Collaboration - Progress Report

July 30 2013

**1. Title:** *A Systematic Review of the Utility of Selection Methods for Specialist Training*

### **2. Group members:**

1. Professor Jill Thistlethwaite, University of Queensland, Queensland, Australia
2. Dr Priya Khanna, The Royal Australasian College of Physicians, New South Wales, Australia
3. Dr Julie Gustavs, The Royal Australasian College of Physicians, New South Wales, Australia
4. A/Prof Jane Kidd, Warwick Medical School, Coventry, UK
5. A/Prof Chris Roberts, University of Sydney, New South Wales, Australia
6. Dr Emma Bartle, University of Queensland, Queensland, Australia
7. A/ Prof Mark Davies, Royal Brisbane and Women's Hospital, Queensland, Australia
8. Dr Bethan Richards, Royal Prince Alfred Hospital, New South Wales, Australia
9. Dr James Lynam, Austin Health, Victoria , Australia
10. Dr Jim Newcombe, Sydney Children's Hospital, New South Wales, Australia
11. Dr Anthony Llewellyn, Health Education and Training Institute, NSW, Australia

### **3. Progress summary**

The pilot phase for the review commenced during May 2013 and is near completion.

***Refinement of search syntax and developing the coding sheet (May 2013)*** - One of the TRG members, EB developed search syntax with the help of University of Queensland library staff based on the study criteria. The initial search spanned across a three-year period (2010-2013). After refining the initial search syntax, a total of 382 citations and abstracts were imported into the EndNote X5. A coding sheet was also developed during this period keeping in view the study objectives and coding sheets used in other reviews.

***TRG meeting and initial scoping (May-June 2013)*** - The first TRG group meeting was held on 24<sup>th</sup> May 2013. The EndNote library and the coding sheet was sent to all the members beforehand. Initial try out of the coding process was undertaken during the meeting. The first 80 citations and abstracts (of the 382) were reviewed by each member individually and, after reaching a consensus, the group agreed to include 10 citation and abstracts. The full paper for one of these articles was coded by all the attendees to test the coding sheet. Initial suggestions were given to improve the sheet.

***Coding of the selected articles (June-July 2013)*** - The remainder of the citations and abstracts (n=312), were reviewed by two TRG members (JT and PK) independently and their decisions compared. Of the 312, 36 citations and abstracts were selected for the scoping phase. Five two-person teams were created and each team coded the full-text of seven articles using the revised coding sheet. In the case of major disagreement between the team members, a third member's opinion was sought.

At present, two of the teams are synthesising their reviews. The data from the coding sheet is being compiled in an Excel spread sheet. Members are being consulted to improve the coding sheet. Certain issues emerging from the use of interactive electronic coding sheet (Adobe Acrobat Pro) are being resolved.

### **4. Anticipated date of completion**

The review seems to be progressing as per the estimated timelines. A pilot report along with revised coding sheet will be developed by September 2013. The full literature search will commence in October 2013 and it is estimated that a draft report will be developed by May 2014.